

David S. Samford Counsel 859.244.3230 dsamford@fbtlaw.com

April 27, 2012

#### VIA HAND-DELIVERY

Mr. Jeffrey Derouen
Executive Director
Kentucky Public Service Commission
211 Sower Boulevard
P. O. Box 615
Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

RECEIVED

APR 27 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Re: In the Matter of: Petition of TracFone Wireless, Inc. for Designation as an

Eligible Telecommunications Carrier in the Commonwealth of Kentucky for the Limited Purpose of Offering Lifeline and Link Up Service to Qualified Households, Case No. 2009-00100 – Quarterly Filing and Petition for

Confidential Treatment

Dear Mr. Derouen:

Enclosed, please find an original and ten copies of TracFone Wireless, Inc.'s Quarterly Report, covering the first three months of 2012, as required to be filed in the Commission's September 23, 2010 Final Order in the above-referenced case. Due to the confidential nature of the information included in this Quarterly Report, the ten copies are redacted and the original unredacted report is filed under seal. An original and ten copies of a Petition for Confidential Treatment relating to this Quarterly Report is also tendered for filing herewith.

Please file these documents in the record and return file-stamped copies to me.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Sincerely yours,

David S. Samford

Enclosures

LEXLibrary 0109989.0565865 508594vvv1

#### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

# BEFORE THE KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

RECEIVED

APR 2 7 2012

TN	J	TF	IF.	M	A'	ГТ	ER	OF	7.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

PETITION OF TRACFONE WIRELESS, INC.	)	
FOR DESIGNATION AS AN ELIGIBLE	)	
TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIER IN THE	)	CASE NO. 2009-00100
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY FOR THE	)	
LIMITED PURPOSE OF OFFERING LIFELINE	)	
AND LINK UP SERVICE TO QUALIFIED	)	
HOUSEHOLDS	)	

## PETITION FOR CONFIDENTIAL TREATMENT OF PROPRIETARY AND COMMERCIALLY SENSITIVE INFORMATION

TracFone Wireless, Inc. ("TracFone"), pursuant to KRS 61.870 *et seq.*, 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7 and other applicable law, respectfully requests the Commission to grant confidentiality to, and protect from public disclosure, certain information provided in compliance with the Commission's September 23, 2010 Order granting TracFone status as an eligible telecommunications carrier for the purpose of offering Lifeline and Link-Up Service to qualified low-income households in the Commonwealth of Kentucky. In support of said petition, TracFone states as follows:

1. The Commission's September 23, 2010 Order requires TracFone to "submit a quarterly report to the Commission...showing the number of customers who have been deactivated for not having any activity on their phone in a 60-day period, not passing annual verification, or voluntarily being deactivated."

- 2. In compliance with the Commission's September 23, 2010 Order, TracFone is filing its quarterly report covering the first three months of 2012. The report includes valuable commercial information, including the number of customers subscribing to TracFone's service who have been de-enrolled. The information is confidential and proprietary and, if openly disclosed, would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors of TracFone.
- 3. The Kentucky Open Records Act exempts from public disclosure certain information, including proprietary information and/or sensitive commercial information. Specifically, KRS 61.878(1)(c)(1) provides:

The following public records are excluded from the application of KRS 61.870 to 61.884 and shall be subject to inspection only upon order of a court of competent jurisdiction...records confidentially disclosed to an agency or required by an agency to be disclosed to it, generally recognized as confidential or proprietary, which if openly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors of the entity that disclosed the records....

The Kentucky Supreme Court has construed this exemption from disclosure to include information which is proprietary and not otherwise publicly available. *See Marina Management Service, Inc. v. Com. of Ky., Cabinet for Tourism*, 906 S.W.2d 318, 319 (Ky. 1995); *Hoy v. Kentucky Industrial Revitalization Authority*, 907 S.W.2d 766, 768 (Ky. 1995).

4. The information contained in TracFone's report is required to be disclosed to the Commission by virtue of conditions imposed in the Commission's September 23, 2010 Order. The information is not publicly available and identifies the number of customers who have been de-enrolled from subscriptions to TracFone's service. The

confidential and proprietary nature of this information has been previously acknowledged by the Commission:

Based on a review of the information and pursuant to KRS 61.878 and 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7, the Commission has determined that the information requested to be held confidential is of a proprietary nature, which if publicly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to Tracfone's competitors.<sup>1</sup>

The information contained in the report satisfies the Kentucky Open Records Act's requirements for exemption and therefore it should be afforded confidential status.

WHEREFORE, on the basis of the foregoing, TracFone respectfully requests that the Commission grant confidential treatment to, and protect from public disclosure, certain information filed herewith under seal as set forth herein.

This 27<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2012.

Respectfully submitted,

Tom O'Brien

David S. Samford

Frost Brown Todd LLC

250 West Main Street, Suite 2800

Lexington, KY 40507-1749

(859) 231-0000 – Telephone (859) 231-0011 – Facsimile

Comment for Toron Error Windson I

Counsel for TracFone Wireless, Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Letter from Jeff Derouen to Stephen Athanson (Sept. 16, 2011). A copy of the letter is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served by delivering same to the custody and care of the U.S. Postal Service, postage pre-paid, addressed to the following on this 27<sup>th</sup> day of April 2012:

Hon. Dennis Howard Office of the Attorney General Utility Intervention and Rate Division 1024 Capital Center Drive Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Mitchell F. Brecher GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP 2101 L Street, NW Suite 1000 Washington, D.C. 20037

Counsel for TracFone Wireless, Inc.

### **CONFIDENTIAL**



# KY - Customer De-Enrollment Report thru Q1 2012: REDACTED

		Jan-12	Feb-12	Mar-12
1	Provide the number of customers who have been			
	de-enrolled for not having activity in a 60 day period or			
	longer.			
7	Provide the number of customers who did not pass the			
	annual verification			
3	Provide the number of customers that were voluntarily			
	de-enrolled.			

Steven L. Beshear Governor

Leonard K. Peters Secretary Energy and Environment Cabinet



Commonwealth of Kentucky
Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615
Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615
Telephone: (502) 564-3940
Fax: (502) 564-3460
psc.ky.gov

David L. Armstrong Chairman

James W. Gardner Vice Chairman

Charles R. Borders Commissioner

September 16, 2011

Tracfone Wireless, Inc. Attention: Stephen Athanson 9700 NW 11<sup>2th</sup> Avenue Miami, Florida 33178

Re: Tracfone Wireless, Inc.

Petition for Confidential Treatment received 7/29/11

PSC Reference - Case No. 2009-00100

Dear Mr. Athanson:

The Public Service Commission has received your letter on July 29, 2011 wherein you have requested confidential protection on behalf of Tracfone Wireless, Inc. ("Tracfone") to protect certain information filed with the Commission as confidential pursuant to Section 7 of 807 KAR 5:001 and KRS 61.870. The information you seek to have treated as confidential is identified as being contained in its Quarterly Activity Report for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of 2011. The information is described as the number of customers subscribing to service who have been de-enrolled.

Your justification for having the Commission handle this material as confidential is that the public disclosure of the information would compromise Tracfone's competitive position in the industry, which would result in an unfair commercial advantage to Tracfone's competitors.

Based on a review of the information and pursuant to KRS 61.878 and 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7, the Commission has determined that the information requested to be held confidential is of a proprietary nature, which if publicly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to Tracfone's competitors. Therefore, the information requested to be treated as confidential meets the criteria for confidential protection and will be maintained as a nonpublic part of the Commission's file in this case. The procedure for usage of confidential materials during formal proceedings may be found at Section 7(8) of 807 KAR 5:001.



An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D



Mr. Athanson September 16, 2011 Page 2

If the information becomes publicly available or no longer warrants confidential treatment, Tracfore Wireless, Inc. ("Tracfone") is required by Section 8(9)(a) of 807 KAR 5:001 to inform the Commission so that the information may be placed in the public record.

Sincerely

//eff l//el/ouen Executive Director

kg/

cc: Parties of Record